

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	v
About the Editors	xix
About the Contributors	xxi
Preface	xxxiii

## CHAPTER 1: FUNDAMENTALS OF SECTION 1983 LITIGATION 1

by Martin A. Schwartz

I. INTRODUCTION	5
II. ELEMENTS OF THE SECTION 1983 CLAIM, FUNCTIONAL ROLE OF SECTION 1983, PLEADING, AND JURISDICTION 6	6
A. Elements of the Section 1983 Claim 6	6
1. <i>Section 1983 Has No State-of-Mind Requirement</i> 6	6
B. Functional Role of Section 1983 7	7
C. Pleading Section 1983 Claims 7	7
D. Federal Court Jurisdiction 9	9
1. <i>Rooker-Feldman Doctrine</i> 9	9
2. <i>Supplemental Jurisdiction</i> 11	11
3. <i>Removal Jurisdiction</i> 12	12
E. State Court Jurisdiction 12	12
III. SECTION 1983 PLAINTIFFS 13	13
IV. CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS ENFORCEABLE UNDER SECTION 1983 14	14
V. ENFORCEMENT OF FEDERAL STATUTES UNDER SECTION 1983 18	18
VI. SECTION 1983 DEFENDANTS: WHO ARE SUABLE PERSONS? 19	19
A. State Defendants 20	20
B. Municipal Defendants 20	20

---

C. Is Defendant Official a State or Municipal Policy Maker?	20
D. Doe Defendants	21
E. Departments, Offices, and Commissions	21
VII. COLOR OF STATE LAW AND STATE ACTION	21
A. State and Local Officials	22
1. <i>Abuse of State Power</i>	22
B. State Action Tests	23
1. <i>Symbiotic Relationship</i>	24
2. <i>Public Function</i>	24
3. <i>Sufficiently Close Nexus</i>	25
4. <i>Joint Participation</i>	26
5. <i>Pervasive Entwinement</i>	26
VIII. CAUSATION	26
IX. CAPACITY OF CLAIM	28
A. Distinctions between Individual and Official Capacity Claims	28
B. Determining Capacity of Claim	29
X. MUNICIPAL LIABILITY	29
A. <i>Monell, Owen, and City of Newport</i>	29
B. Types of Municipal Policies and Practices	30
C. Causation	30
D. Separating Violation of Constitutional Rights and Basis for Municipal Liability	31
E. Municipal Policy Makers	31
F. Inadequate Training	32
G. Inadequate Employment Screening	33
XI. LIABILITY OF SUPERVISORS	34
A. Comparison with Municipal Liability	34
B. Standards for Imposing Liability against Supervisors	35
XII. RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN INDIVIDUAL AND MUNICIPAL LIABILITY	36
A. Bifurcation of Personal Capacity and Municipal Liability Claims	36
B. <i>Los Angeles v. Heller</i>	37
C. Relationship of Qualified Immunity to Municipal Liability	37

---

D. Cost-Allocation Scheme	38
XIII. STATE LIABILITY: THE 11TH AMENDMENT	38
A. Interplay of 11th Amendment and Section 1983 “Person”	38
B. 11th Amendment Protects State Treasury	39
C. <i>Ex parte Young</i> : Prospective Relief	39
D. Personal Capacity Claims	41
E. Municipal and Hybrid Entities	41
F. Waiver	41
G. Appeals	42
XIV. PERSONAL CAPACITY CLAIMS: ABSOLUTE IMMUNITIES	42
A. Absolute versus Qualified Immunity: The Functional Approach	42
B. Judicial Immunity	42
C. Prosecutorial Immunity	43
D. Witness Immunity	45
E. Legislative Immunity	46
F. Social Workers	46
XV. PERSONAL LIABILITY: QUALIFIED IMMUNITY	46
A. Who May Assert Qualified Immunity?	47
B. Clearly Established Federal Law	49
C. Procedural Aspects of Qualified Immunity	51
1. <i>Raising the Immunity Defense; Facts             in Dispute; Discovery</i>	51
2. <i>Court’s “Pearson” Discretion to First Decide             Merits or Proceed Directly to Qualified             Immunity</i>	53
D. Qualified Immunity Appeals	54
XVI. EXHAUSTION OF STATE REMEDIES (INCLUDING THE HECK DOCTRINE)	55
A. State Judicial Remedies	55
1. <i>The Preiser-Heck Doctrine</i>	55
B. State Administrative Remedies	57
1. <i>PLRA</i>	57
C. Notice of Claim	59
D. Ripeness	59

XVII. PRECLUSION DEFENSES	60
A. Administrative Res Judicata	60
B. Arbitration Decisions	61
XVIII. STATUTE OF LIMITATIONS	61
A. Limitations Period	61
B. Relation Back	61
C. Accrual	62
D. Tolling the Limitations Period	63
XIX. SURVIVORSHIP AND WRONGFUL DEATH	63
A. Survivorship	63
B. Wrongful Death	64
XX. ABSTENTION DOCTRINES	64
A. <i>Pullman</i> Abstention	64
B. <i>Younger</i> Abstention	65
C. <i>Colorado River</i> Abstention	66
D. <i>Burford</i> Abstention	66
E. Domestic Relations Doctrine	67
F. Tax Injunction Act	67
XXI. MONETARY RELIEF	68
A. Compensatory Damages	68
B. Punitive Damages	68
C. Release-Dismissal Agreements	69
D. Indemnification	69
XXII. STATUTORY ATTORNEYS' FEES	70
A. Prevailing Parties	70
B. Computation of Fee Award	73
C. Other Statutory Fee Issues	74
1. <i>11th Amendment</i>	74
2. <i>Rule 68 Offer of Judgment</i>	74
3. <i>Ethical Concerns Relating to Settlement Offers</i>	75

## CHAPTER 2 PLAINTIFF'S LITIGATION STRATEGY CONSIDERATIONS

by Anna Benvenuti Hoffmann, Alexandra Lampert,  
and Ranjana Natarajan

### I. INTRODUCTION

II. INITIATING A CASE: AN OVERVIEW FOR PLAINTIFF'S COUNSEL	116
A. Pre-Filing Factual and Legal Investigation	117
1. <i>Initial Considerations: Statute of Limitations             and Notice of Claim</i>	118
2. <i>Initial Considerations: Goals, Costs,             and Risks of Litigation</i>	119
B. Readiness of Claims for Court	121
1. <i>Justiciability: Ripeness, Standing, Mootness</i>	121
2. <i>Exhaustion Requirements and Related             Concerns</i>	123
III. INITIAL SELECTION OF FORUM	125
A. Concurrent over Section 1983 Claims	125
B. Factors to Consider in Forum Choice	125
C. Limitations on Section 1983 Plaintiff's Choice of Forum	127
1. <i>Removal</i>	127
2. <i>The Pennhurst Situation</i>	127
IV. PLEADING AND FILING THE SECTION 1983 LAWSUIT	128
A. Federal Rule 8: Plausibility under <i>Iqbal</i> and <i>Twombly</i>	128
B. Specific Issues Post- <i>Twombly/Iqbal</i>	130
1. <i>Pleading Requirements for Defendants' State             of Mind</i>	130
2. <i>Pleading "on Information and Belief"</i>	131
3. <i>Incorporating Materials into the Pleading             by Reference</i>	132
C. Specific Pleading Considerations: Naming Defendants	132
1. <i>Individual or Official Capacity</i>	132
2. <i>Other Potential Defendants</i>	134
3. <i>John Doe Defendants</i>	134
D. Additional Elements of a Complaint	135
1. <i>Jurisdiction</i>	135
2. <i>Venue</i>	136
3. <i>Conditions Precedent</i>	137
4. <i>Jury Demand</i>	137

## CHAPTER 3 DEFENDANT'S LITIGATION STRATEGY CONSIDERATIONS

by Jeff Lowe

I. INVESTIGATION AND INFORMATION	
GATHERING	147
A. Removal	148
B. Defenses to Raise	150
1. <i>Affirmative Defenses</i>	150
2. <i>Motion to Dismiss versus Answer</i>	153
C. Bifurcation	156
D. Discovery	157
1. <i>Rule 26(f) Conference</i>	157
2. <i>Initial Disclosures</i>	158
3. <i>Limits on Discovery</i>	158
4. <i>Federal Rule 30(b)(6) Deposition</i>	160
5. <i>Expert Witnesses</i>	161
6. <i>Additional Discovery Considerations</i>	162

## CHAPTER 4 CLAIMS UNDER 42 U.S.C. § 1983: A DISCUSSION OF PROCEDURAL ISSUES AND IMMUNITIES

by Michael S. Bogren

I. OVERVIEW	168
A. Elements of Cause of Action	168
B. "Every Person"	169
C. Deprivation of Rights, Privileges, or Immunities	170
D. Under Color of State Law	171
II. PROCEDURAL ISSUES IN SECTION 1983 LITIGATION	172
A. Jurisdiction	172
B. Requirements of a Section 1983 Complaint	174
C. Affirmative Defenses	175
D. Rule 12 Motions	176
E. Evidentiary and Discovery Issues	177
1. <i>Discovery in Qualified Immunity Cases</i>	177

2. <i>Evidentiary Privileges</i>	178
3. <i>Use of Expert Witnesses</i>	179
F. Summary Judgment	180
G. Collateral Order Doctrine	183
III. ABSOLUTE IMMUNITIES	186
A. Introduction	186
B. Legislative Immunity	187
C. Absolute Judicial Immunity	192
D. Absolute Prosecutorial Immunity	195
E. Absolute Witness Immunity	200
IV. QUALIFIED IMMUNITY	200
A. Introduction	200
B. Background	201
C. Supreme Court Treatment of Qualified Immunity	203
D. Qualified Immunity Framework	204
E. Clearly Established Law	206
F. Appropriate Level of Specificity	207
G. Assessing the Conduct of the Defendant	209
V. CONCLUSION	210

## CHAPTER 5 FIRST AMENDMENT CLAIMS

by Steven C. Stern and Chelsea Weisbord

I. INTRODUCTION	229
II. GOVERNMENT REGULATION OF SPEECH: GENERAL PRINCIPLES	230
III. GOVERNMENT-REGULATED SPEECH AND THE FORUM APPROACH	232
IV. RETALIATION FOR PUBLIC EMPLOYEE SPEECH	236
V. RETALIATION AGAINST PRIVATE CITIZENS	239
VI. STUDENT SPEECH	239
VII. THE FREE EXERCISE AND ESTABLISHMENT CLAUSES	241
VIII. RECORDING POLICE ACTIVITY	244
IX. RETALIATORY ARRESTS	245
X. CONCLUSION	247

## CHAPTER 6 SECOND AMENDMENT RIGHTS CHALLENGES TO STATE AND MUNICIPAL FIREARM REGULATION

by John Parker Sweeney and Marc Nardone

I. INTRODUCTION	264
II. LIMITED PRE- <i>HELLER</i> SECOND AMENDMENT JURISPRUDENCE	265
III. <i>HELLER</i> AND <i>MCDONALD</i> REVITALIZE THE SECOND AMENDMENT	266
A. <i>District of Columbia v. Heller</i> Recognizes an Individual Right to Keep and Bear Arms Guaranteed by the Second Amendment	266
B. <i>McDonald v. City of Chicago</i> Confirms <i>Heller</i> and Applies the Second Amendment to the States	269
IV. POST- <i>HELLER</i> JURISPRUDENCE SEEKS TO CLARIFY THE MANY ISSUES LEFT OPEN IN <i>HELLER</i> AND <i>MCDONALD</i>	271
A. Courts Evaluating Second Amendment Challenges Have Used a Variety of Analytical Approaches	271
1. <i>Text, History, and Tradition</i>	271
2. <i>The Two-Part Approach</i>	272
3. <i>Ad Hoc Tests</i>	273
B. Specific Types of Challenges	274
1. “Who” Challenges	274
2. “Where” Challenges	276
3. “What” Challenges	277
C. Practical Considerations Drawn from Emerging Case Law	279
V. CONCLUSION	281

## CHAPTER 7 THE FOURTH AMENDMENT

by Kathleen Wieneke and Christina Retts

I. 42 U.S.C. SECTION 1983	288
II. WHEN IS THERE A REASONABLE EXPECTATION OF PRIVACY?	289



---

III. THE WARRANT REQUIREMENT AND ITS EXCEPTIONS	289
IV. WHAT IS A SEARCH?	291
V. WHAT IS A SEIZURE?	292
VI. USE OF FORCE	294
A. The <i>Graham</i> Factors	294
VII. SPECIFIC USES OF FORCE	297
A. Deadly Force	297
B. Nonlethal Force	298
C. Chemical Agents	298
D. Impact Weapons	299
E. Canine	299
F. Control Holds	299
G. Conducted Energy Weapon	301
VIII. EVIDENTIARY ISSUES IN USE-OF-FORCE CASES	301
A. After-Acquired Evidence	301
B. Provocation Evidence: Creating the Need for Force	303
IX. VIOLATION OF INTERNAL POLICE POLICIES	304
X. SPECIFIC FOURTH AMENDMENT CLAIMS	304
A. Claims Relating to Bystander Liability	304
B. Integral Participation	305
C. Failure to Intervene	306
XI. CLAIMS ARISING OUT OF ARREST	306
XII. THE FOURTH AMENDMENT IN SCHOOLS	307
A. Strip Searches	308
B. Law Enforcement Officer/School Resource Officer Searches	309
C. Drug Testing	309
D. Electronic Searches	309
XIII. THE FOURTH AMENDMENT IN THE WORKPLACE	310
A. Workplace Searches	310
B. Drug Testing	311
C. Electronic Searches	312

## CHAPTER 8 THE TAKING OF PRIVATE PROPERTY

by Dwight Merriam

I. A TAKINGS TAXONOMY	336
A. Direct and Indirect Takings	336
B. Takings by Overregulation	338
1. <i>Physical Takings by Regulation</i>	338
2. <i>Categorical Regulatory Takings</i>	341
3. <i>Partial Regulatory Takings</i>	342
II. MAKING TAKINGS CLAIMS	343
A. The Very First Question to Ask	343
B. The Relevant Parcel	343
C. The Police Power Exception	344
D. Jurisdiction of the Court	345
E. Vested Rights	347
F. Challenge Based on State or Local Action	347
G. The Nature of the Taking	347
1. <i>Physical Invasion Takings</i>	347
2. <i>Penn Central Partial Regulatory Takings Path</i>	348
3. <i>Ripeness</i>	349
4. <i>Time Limitation</i>	349
5. <i>Reasonable Economic Use</i>	350
6. <i>Background Principles of Property</i> <i>and Nuisance Law</i>	350
H. The Future of Takings Claims	350
III. CONCLUSION	355

## CHAPTER 9 THE EIGHTH AMENDMENT

by Rhonda R. Stowers

I. INTRODUCTION	363
II. EXCESSIVE BAIL	364
III. EXCESSIVE FINES	367
IV. CRUEL AND UNUSUAL PUNISHMENT	371
A. Defining Punishment under the Eighth Amendment	372
B. Defining “Cruel and Unusual”	373

C. The Ultimate Punishment—The Death Penalty	375
D. Proportionality—The Punishment Must Fit the Crime	378
E. Prison Conditions	378
1. <i>Use of Force</i>	380
2. <i>Assaults by Other Prisoners</i>	381
3. <i>Medical Care and Treatment</i>	382
4. <i>Other Prison Conditions</i>	385
F. Potential Bars to Litigation—The Prison Litigation Reform Act and the “Three Strikes” Rule	387

## CHAPTER 10 THE FOURTEENTH AMENDMENT

by Phillip Friduss, Russell Britt, and Pearson Cunningham

I. INTRODUCTION	402
II. BACKGROUND	405
A. The Meaning of Life, Liberty, and Property	405
1. <i>Property</i>	405
2. <i>Liberty</i>	406
B. Culpability Requirements	406
C. <i>Graham v. Connor</i> and Specific Textual Sources	407
D. Affirmative Duties, State-Created Dangers, and Special Relationships	408
1. <i>Generally, the State Owes No Affirmative Duties</i>	408
2. <i>A Special Relationship May Confer Certain “Affirmative Duties”</i>	409
3. <i>State-Created Dangers</i>	410
III. SUBSTANTIVE DUE PROCESS	412
A. Police Officers	412
B. Public Employment-Related Claims	413
C. Public Schools	414
IV. PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS	414
A. The Nature of the Claim: Notice and an Opportunity to Be Heard	414
B. The <i>Matthews</i> Factors	415

C. The <i>Parratt</i> Doctrine	416
D. Procedural Due Process Claims in the Circuits	417
1. <i>Parking and Traffic Violations</i>	417
2. <i>Local Code Enforcement</i>	417
3. <i>Disciplinary Hearings</i>	418
V. CONCLUSION	418
Table of Cases	431
Index	485