

Index

A

- Action termination statistics, 156
- Active model of judicial involvement in settlement, 107–108
- Adjudication process and meritless claims, 24
- Administration of settlements, 109, 117–118, 139–140
- Administrative orders, 75–76, 77, 78
- Adversarial model. *See* Traditional adversarial model
- Adverse event report, 44
- Advertising for claimants, 13, 80–81
- Advisory Committee on Rules of Civil Procedure, 147, 150, 151
- A.H. Robins bankruptcy, 164–165
- Allocation of settlement funds, 17, 20–21, 81–82, 170. *See also* Windfalls for counsel
- Alternatives to multidistrict litigation
 - bankruptcy, 161–166
 - class action, 159–161
 - individual claims litigation, 155–159
- Amchem Products* case, 113, 159–160
- Antitrust claims, 75

- Appellate review. *See* Interlocutory appeal
- Appointment of lead counsel, 12
- Asbestos* MDL, 78–80, 163–164
- Attorneys' fees, 20, 117–118.
See also Windfalls for counsel

B

- Bankruptcy, 135, 161–166
- Bankruptcy Reform Act of 1994, 163
- Bellwether process
 - case selection, 90–97
 - case-specific issues resolution, 76–77
 - criticism of, 87–90
 - judicial education, 126
 - jury pool, 138
 - meritless claims, 24–26
 - multi-plaintiff trials, 99–100
 - plaintiff counsel, 98–99, 117
 - reform proposals, 149–150
 - scheduling orders, 54–55
 - as step to settlement, 85–86
 - trial location, 97–98
 - utility of, 100–101
- Best practices, 15, 141, 154, 168, 170
- Bias and special masters, 34

- Bolch Judicial Institute (Duke)
 - guidelines
 - action termination statistics, 156
 - bellwether cases, 55, 101
 - case management, 28–29
 - common issues, resolution
 - of, 60
 - early disclosure, 41–42
 - efficiency in resolving dispositive
 - pretrial motions, 60
 - guidelines as alternative to
 - reform, 154
 - judicial involvement in settlement
 - administration, 109
 - phased disclosure, 52
 - physician affidavits and causation
 - disputes, 77–78
 - product identification, 47
 - standardized interrogatories
 - and document requests, 45
 - Breyer, Stephen, 79
 - Brody, Anita, 139
 - Burch, Elizabeth Chamblee
 - bellwether process, 25–26
 - lack of judicial engagement, 105
 - omnibus motions, 61
 - plaintiff compensation issues, 16–17
 - plaintiff counsel disputes, 98
 - settlement administration
 - problems, 139
 - windfalls for counsel, 22
- C**
- Case management, 28–32
 - case-specific issues, 76–77
 - dispositive motion practice, 64
 - initial disclosure, 43–44, 47–48
 - innovation, 169
 - remand packets, 158
 - Case numbers, 5, 12–13, 14, 15–19
 - Case selection, bellwether, 86, 87, 90–97, 149–150
 - Case-specific issues, resolution of
 - allocation of settlement funds, 81–82
 - case management, 76–77
 - cases with thousands of claims, 78–80
 - common issue overlap, 69–70
 - lack of judicial engagement, 123
 - motion practice, 70–75
 - remandment of cases, 82–84
 - sanctions, 80–81
 - scheduling orders, 54
 - Case termination statistics, 156
 - Case transfer request, 8–9
 - Caseload statistics, 2
 - Causation
 - discovery, 50–51
 - Incretin Mimetics* MDL, 153–154
 - multi-plaintiff bellwether
 - trials, 99
 - physician affidavits, 77–78
 - scrutiny of scientific evidence, 61–64
 - Census, initial, 144–145
 - Chapter 11 bankruptcy, 135, 162–165
 - Civil Rules Advisory Committee, 142
 - Class action
 - as alternative to multidistrict
 - litigation, 159–161
 - multidistrict litigation compared
 - to, 2, 17
 - overlap with MDL cases, 112–114
 - settlements, 53, 107, 110
 - Class certification, 51, 112–113, 160
 - Class settlement, 112–114
 - Committees, plaintiff, 36–40, 98, 111, 116–117, 151
 - Common benefit fund, 36–37
 - Common issues, resolution of
 - case-specific issue overlap, 69–70
 - case-specific motions in parallel
 - with, 70–72

- component parts suppliers, 66–67
- efficiency in resolving, 57
- lack of judicial engagement, 122–123, 124
- scheduling orders, 54
- scientific evidence, scrutiny of, 61–64
- tag-along cases, 32
- warning adequacy, 64–66
- Compensation. *See* Settlement
- Component parts suppliers, 66–67
- Conflicts, plaintiff counsel, 38–39, 116–117
- Consent to bellwether cases, 95, 149–150
- Constitutional concerns, 157. *See also* Due process
- Cost/benefit analysis
 - bellwether process, 55, 100–101
 - multidistrict litigation
 - consolidation, 4–5
- Cost-sharing measures, 44
- Court-appointed third parties. *See* Independent experts; Special masters
- Court orders and parallel state court litigation, 129
- D**
- Dalkon Shield IUD, 164–165
- Data, collecting and publicizing, 170
- Daubert* motions, 62, 64, 72, 73, 105, 130
- Deepwater Horizon* MDL, 139–140
- Defective products. *See* Product liability
- Defendants and defense counsel
 - bellwether process criticisms, 87
 - costs vs benefits of multidistrict litigation, 4–5
 - fact sheets, 44–45
 - individual claims litigation, 158–159
 - initial disclosure reform proposals, 144
 - interlocutory appeals, 134–135, 147
 - judicial education, 28
 - judicial engagement, dissatisfaction with, 124
 - multi-plaintiff bellwether trials, 99
 - parallel state court litigation, 130–131
 - party-selected bellwether cases, 92–93
 - phased discovery, 52
 - pressure to settle, 16
 - reform, need for, 152–154
 - settlement, 106–107, 110, 111
 - time considerations in transfer of cases, 8–9
 - venue choice effects, 7
- Deferred remand motion rulings, 131–132
- Diagnosis issues, 72, 76–78, 79
- Digitek* MDL, 73
- Disclosure. *See* Discovery and information exchange
- Discovery and information exchange
 - bellwether process, 94
 - Bolch Judicial Institute guidelines, 41–42
 - fact sheets, 42–47
 - guidelines, 41–42
 - medical records of plaintiffs, 55–56
 - parallel state court litigation, 127, 129, 130
 - phased discovery, 48–52, 53
 - product identification, 47–48
 - reform proposals, 143–146, 153
 - tag-along cases, 31–32
- Dismissal, voluntary. *See* Voluntary dismissal

Dispositive motions
 appellate review, 134, 148
 bellwether cases and resolution
 of, 86
 claims viability, 60
 discovery, 49, 54
 remandment of cases, 158
 Dissatisfaction with the process
 judge selection, 119–122
 jury pool, 139–140
 lack of judicial engagement,
 122–126
 parallel state court litigation,
 126–132
 settlement administration,
 139–140
 single decision maker model,
 132–138

Diversity, jurisdictional, 88
 Dividing large MDLs, 152
 Document depositories, 129
 Document requests, 45
 Dow Corning bankruptcy, 164
 Drug warnings, 50, 64–66
 Dual track case-specific and generic
 motions, 70–72
 Due process, 17, 18, 39, 53, 113
 Duke University guidelines.
See Bolch Judicial Institute
 (Duke) guidelines

E

Early disclosure. *See* Discovery and
 information exchange
 Economic loss claims, 160
 Efficiency
 bankruptcy, 161–162
 class action proceedings, 53
 individual claims litigation, 158
 meritless claims, 18, 20
 purpose of multidistrict litigation,
 1–2, 4–5
 resolution of dispositive pretrial
 motions, 60
 scheduling orders, 56–57

Electronic document
 depositories, 129
 Experts, 32–35, 62–63, 79

F

Fact sheets, 42–47, 72, 143, 144
*Fairness in Class Action Litigation
 Act of 2017*, 143, 144
 Fairness of settlements, 107, 109
 Fallon, Eldon, 21, 86
 Federal Judicial Center
 bellwether cases, 85–86
 case management guidelines,
 28–29, 30
 efficiency in resolving dispositive
 pretrial motions, 60
 interlocutory appeals, 134
 overlapping state and national
 class actions, 51
 parallel proceedings, 115
 parallel state court litigation,
 128, 130
 phased discovery, 52
 random bellwether case
 selection, 90
 remandment of cases, 83, 89, 157
 settlement negotiations, 103–104
 short rulings, 57
 special masters, 34
 Federal law preemption, 50–51
 Federal Rules of Civil Procedure
 applicability of, 19, 45
 basis for dismissal of claims, 75
 class action, 107, 159–160
 due process, 17
 pleading requirements, 73–74
 pretrial conferences and
 scheduling orders, 30–31
 scheduling orders, 56
 scrutiny of claims, 168
 settlements, 107
 special masters, 32
 traditional adversarial model,
 168, 169
 Federal Rules of Evidence, 33

Filing fees, 74–75

Financial issues

allocation of settlement funds,
17, 20–21, 81–82, 170

bankruptcy proceeding costs, 162

common benefit fund, 36–37

filing fees, 74–75

lawyer *vs.* plaintiff compensation,
21–24

meritless claims, 11–14

monetary sanctions for frivolous
claims, 44

sanctions for meritless claims,
80, 81

windfalls for counsel, 21–23, 82,
110–111, 118

Food and Drug Administration, 50,
64–65, 153–154

Forum shopping, 7, 159

Fosamax MDL, 64–65

Fraud in settlement programs,
139–140

Front end *vs.* back end scrutiny of
claims, 21–24, 82, 124

Funding. *See* Financial issues

Furman, Jesse, 129

G

Gamesmanship and the bellwether
process, 87, 92–93

General Motors Ignition Switch
litigation, 25–26, 98,
117, 129

Generic issues. *See* Common issues

Generic pharmaceuticals, 65

“Good cause” for removal of
bellwether cases, 96

Guidelines as alternative to reform,
154, 168

H

Hearings and case management,
29, 46

Heparin MDL, 70–71, 115

Hybrid case selection processes, 96

I

Imerys Talc America, 165

Incretin Mimetics MDL, 50,
153–154

Independent experts, 32–35

Individual claims litigation, 155–159

Informal reform, 168, 169–170

Initial disclosure. *See* Discovery and
information exchange

Insys Therapeutics, 165

Inter-circuit transfer, 89, 98

Interlocutory appeal, 133–138,
146–149

Interrogatories, 45

Iqbal case, 73–74

J

Judges

attorneys’ fees, review of, 117–118

bellwether case selection, 91–92

case management, 28–32

concerns over meritless claims,
18–19

lack of engagement by, 105,
122–126

lobbying for cases, 7–8

parallel state court litigation,
128–129, 130

remandment of cases, 88–89,
97–98, 131–132

review of attorneys’ fees, 117–118

selection of, 119–122

settlement role, 104–109, 111,
150–152

single decision maker model,
132–138

See also Transferor judges

Judicial education, 28, 46, 91–92,
125–126

Judicial Panel on Multidistrict
Litigation

establishing the proceeding, 4–9

judge selection, 120, 121

judges’ assessment of meritless
claims, 18–19

Jurisdiction. *See* Trial location
Jury pool, 138–139

K

Key issues, identification of, 30, 31

L

Labeling, drug, 64–66
Land, Clay, 18
Lead counsel, 12, 107, 116–117
Leadership committees, 36–40, 98, 111, 116–117, 151
Lexecon case, 88, 149–150
Liaisons, court, 131
Lipitor MDL, 61–62
Litigation funding, 13
Lobbying by the judiciary, 7–8
Lone Pine orders, 49, 70, 77, 83, 112

M

Magistrate judges, 32–34, 78–79, 133
Manual for Complex Litigation (Federal Judicial Center), 31, 52, 90, 128
Mass screening diagnoses, 72, 76–77
Medical device and implant cases, 62, 66–67
Medical records of personal injury plaintiffs, 55
Mega-MDLs, 12–13, 113–114, 141–142
Mega-multidistrict litigation cases, 12–13
Mentor Obtape Transobturator Sling MDL, 80–81
Meridia MDL, 51, 66
Meritless claims
allocation of settlement funds, 20–21
bellwether trials, 24–26
compensation for, 110
factors leading to, 11–14

front end *vs.* back end scrutiny of, 21–24

increase in numbers of, 15–19
initial disclosure reform

proposals, 145, 146

monetary sanctions, 44

settlement fraud, 139–140

See also Case-specific issues, resolution of

Meritorious claims, 16–17, 20–21

Mirena MDL, 62–63

Motion practice. *See* Case-specific issues, resolution of;

Common issues, resolution

of; Dispositive motions

Multi-plaintiff bellwether trials, 99–100

Multidistrict litigation

establishing the proceeding, 4–9
purpose of, 1–4

N

Narrowing the scope of proceedings, 61–64, 75, 77, 130, 158

National Prescription Opiate MDL, 104, 114, 136–137, 161

Negotiation class, 161

Negotiations, settlement, 103–104, 108

NFL Concussion MDL, 139

Noncompliance, plaintiff fact sheet, 46–47

Norplant MDL, 66

O

Omnibus motions. *See* Common issues

Opiate litigation, 104, 114, 136–137, 161, 165

Opt-out cases, 111–112

Ortiz case, 113, 159–160

Outlier cases, 89, 91, 94–95

Overlapping state and national class actions, 50–51

P

- Parallel state court litigation,
 - 114–116, 126–132,
 - 138–139
- Party involvement in bellwether case selection, 92–93, 95, 149–150
- Personal injury cases
 - bankruptcy, 163, 164, 165
 - case screening, 12–13
 - case-specific issues, 78–79
 - class certification, 113, 159–160
 - Daubert* motions, 64
 - discovery and information exchange, 51
 - increase in case numbers, 15
 - medical records of plaintiffs, 55–56
- Phased discovery, 48–52, 53
- Phenylpropanolamine (PPA)* case, 63–64, 130
- Physician affidavits, 76–78
- Physician claims review, 21–22
- Piecemeal settlements, 115
- Plaintiff fact sheets, 42–44, 46–47, 143, 144
- Plaintiff steering committees, 36, 37, 39
- Plaintiffs and plaintiff counsel
 - case screening, 12–14
 - coordination of, 35–40, 98–99
 - economic loss claims, 160
 - financial incentive for meritless claims, 11–12
 - independent expert reports, 79
 - individual claims litigation, 155–158
 - initial disclosure reform, 143–146
 - interlocutory appeals, 148
 - judicial engagement,
 - dissatisfaction with, 122–123
 - judicial review of attorneys' fees, 117–118
 - medical records, 55–56
 - meritorious *vs.* meritless claims, 16–17
 - multi-plaintiff bellwether trials, 99–100
 - on the need for reform, 152–153
 - parallel state court litigation, 127, 132
 - party-selected bellwether cases, 92–93
 - pleading requirements, 73–74
 - process transparency, 170
 - sanctions for meritless claims, 81
 - time considerations in transfer of cases, 8–9
 - trial location, 6–7
 - windfalls for counsel, 21–23, 82, 110–111, 118
 - See also* Settlement
- Pleading requirements, 73–74
- PLIVA, Inc. v. Mensing*, 65
- PPA* case. *See Phenylpropanolamine (PPA)* case
- Pradaxa* MDL, 105, 107
- Preemption rulings, 50, 64–65
- Pretrial procedure
 - conferences, 29, 30–31
 - framework, 45–46
 - judicial engagement, 105
 - parallel state court litigation, 129
 - purpose of multidistrict litigation, 3–4
 - third parties, involvement of, 32
- Procedural fairness and settlements, 107
- Product identification, 47–48, 71, 143
- Product liability
 - component parts suppliers, 66–67
 - defendant fact sheets, 44
 - disclosure, 43
 - exposure establishment, 73
 - failure to warn, 65
 - initial census, 144
 - meritless cases, 14

Product liability (*continued*)
 phased discovery, 52
 plaintiff fact sheets, 46–47
 product identification, 47–48
 short-form complaints, 75
Propulsid MDL, 21–23, 82
 Purdue Pharma, 165
 Purpose of multidistrict
 litigation, 1–4

R

Random bellwether case selection,
 90–91
 Recruiting of plaintiffs, 13, 72, 80–81
 Recusal, judge, 107–108
 Redish, Martin, 17
 Reform proposals
 bellwether procedure, 149–150
 benefits of, 142–143
 debate regarding, 167–168
 initial disclosure, 143–146
 interlocutory appeals, 146–149
 judicial role, 142
 need for, 141–142
 settlement, 150–152
 Rejection of consolidation
 requests, 5–6
 Remandment of cases
 alternatives to multidistrict
 litigation, 155–159
 bellwether process, 88–89, 97–98
 case-specific issues, 82–84
 motions for, 8–9
 parallel state court litigation,
 131–132
 Representative cases. *See* Bellwether
 process
 Robreno, Eduardo, 18, 59–60,
 78–80, 163
 Rothstein, Barbara, 64
Roundup MDL, 127
 Rule 23, 107, 109, 112–113, 135,
 150–151, 159
 Rulings in tag-along cases, 31–32

S

Sanctions for meritless claims, 80, 81
 Scheduling orders, 30–32, 49,
 53–57, 124–125, 153–154
 Scientific evidence
 case-specific issues, resolution
 of, 71
 common issues, resolution of,
 61–64
 Daubert motions, 64, 130
 discovery, 49
 independent experts, 32–33
 judicial education, 125
 lack of, 50
 multi-plaintiff bellwether
 trials, 299
 parallel state court litigation, 130
 Screening cases, 11, 145
 Scrutiny of claims
 front end *vs.* back end scrutiny,
 21–24
 judicial engagement, lack of, 105,
 122–126
 scientific evidence, 61–64, 71
 weaknesses of claims
 consolidation, 14, 16–17
 See also Discovery and
 information exchange
 Settlement
 bellwether process, 25–26, 93,
 95–96
 class action examples, 53
 class settlement, 112–114
 court role in, 104–109
 fraud in, 139–140
 grids, 21, 110
 judicial efficiency, 18
 lack of judicial engagement, 122,
 123–124
 meritless claims, 14
 parallel proceedings, 114–116
 plaintiff counsel, 103–104,
 116–117
 pressure for, 16

- reform proposals, 150–152
 - scrutiny of claims, 21–24
 - traditional adversarial model *vs.*, 169
 - types, 109–112
 - See also* Administration of settlements; Allocation of settlement funds; Windfalls for counsel
 - Severance of multi-party claims, 74–75
 - Short-form complaints, 85
 - Short rulings, 57
 - Show-cause orders, 80–81
 - Silica* MDL, 72
 - Silicone breast implants litigation, 164
 - Single decision maker model, 119–120, 132–133, 152
 - Special masters, 32–34, 131, 133
 - Standardized interrogatories and document requests, 45
 - State courts
 - aggregated proceedings, 52–53
 - liaisons, 131
 - parallel proceedings, 114–116, 126–132, 138–139
 - remand motions, 8–9
 - removal from, 3
 - State laws, 50–51, 74
 - Status hearings, 46
 - Status reports and case management, 32
 - Statute of limitations, 73
 - Steering committees, 36, 37, 39
 - Subcommittees, plaintiff, 39
 - Summary judgment
 - bellwether cases, 23
 - causation issues, 61
 - Fosamax* case, 64–65
 - plaintiff support of claims *vs.*, 77–78
 - rules of civil procedure, 20
 - scheduling orders, 49, 50, 51
 - Supreme Court rulings
 - bellwether process, 88, 149
 - class action, 113–114, 159–160
 - federal law preemption, 50, 65
 - remandment of cases, 59
- T**
- Tag-along cases, 31–32
 - Talc* litigation, 165
 - Taxotere* MDL, 47–48, 74–75, 96
 - Test cases. *See* Bellwether process
 - Third parties
 - litigation financing, 13
 - settlement activities, 108
 - special masters and independent experts, 32–35
 - Time considerations
 - interlocutory appeals, 148–149
 - meritless claims, 24
 - scheduling flexibility, 153–154
 - scheduling orders, 56
 - scrutiny of claims, 27–28
 - TMJ Implants* MDL, 66–67
 - Traditional adversarial model, 14, 104, 106, 168–169
 - Transfer motions, 4
 - Transfer of cases. *See* Remandment of cases
 - Transferor judges, 88–89, 97–98
 - Transparency, 108–109, 120, 121, 170
 - Trial location
 - bellwether process, 88–89, 97–98
 - individual claims litigation, 157–158, 159
 - jury pool issues, 138
 - transferee district selection, 5–8, 132
 - Trial packages, 86
 - Trial pool. *See* Bellwether process
 - Trial selection, bellwether, 86, 87, 90–97
 - Twombly* case, 73–74, 75

V

- Venue selection. *See* Trial location
- Vetoes, party
 - bellwether cases, 94–95, 149–150
 - judge selection, 121–122
- Viability of bellwether cases, 90–91
- Vioxx* MDL, 82
- Voluntary dismissal, 24–25
 - bellwether process, 92–93, 94, 95
 - case management, 123
 - case-specific issues, 70, 71, 76

- expert opinions, 126
- fact sheets, 42
- product identification information, 48

W

- Warnings, product, 50, 64–66
- Websites, court, 29
- Welding Fume* MDL, 76–77, 89
- Windfalls for counsel, 21–23, 82, 110–111, 118
- Writs of mandamus, 136