

# Contents

<b>Dedications</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>About the Authors</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>About the Editor</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Acknowledgments to the 2013 Edition</b>	<b>xiii</b>
<b>Introduction</b>	<b>xv</b>
<i>Chapter 1</i>	
<b>The Duty to Preserve Evidence</b>	<b>1</b>
Applicable Law	2
Triggering the Duty to Preserve Evidence	7
Other Sources of the Duty to Preserve Evidence	15
Scope of the Duty to Preserve	17
The Obligation to Supervise Preservation	24
Obligations to Preserve Evidence in the Possession of Third Parties	28
<i>Chapter 2</i>	
<b>Record Retention and Preservation Measures</b>	<b>35</b>
Designing a Document Retention Program	40
Determining Retention Requirements	46
Suspension of a Document Retention Policy	50
Post-Trigger Preservation Measures	55
The Legal or Litigation “Hold”	56
Other Preservation Safeguards	58
<i>Chapter 3</i>	
<b>Remedies and Sanctions for Spoliation in Pending Litigation</b>	<b>61</b>
Sources of Authority for Sanctions	62
Rules of Civil Procedure	62
Court’s Inherent Authority	64
Factors Courts Consider To Remedy Spoliation	67
Culpability of the Offender	70
The Degree of Prejudice Caused by the Spoliator	72
Remedies and Sanctions for Spoliation of Evidence	74
Adverse Jury Inference	74
Rationales for Imposing an Adverse Inference	75
Culpability Courts Require to Impose an Adverse Inference	76

**iv**      **SPOILIATION OF EVIDENCE**

Alternative Approaches Applying the Adverse Inference	79
Exclusion of Evidence or Expert Testimony	83
Factors Courts Consider in Determining Whether to Exclude Evidence	84
Dismissal and Default Judgment	86
Other Sanctions and Remedies Imposed in Pending Litigation	90

*Chapter 4*

<b>Independent Causes of Action for Spoliation</b>	<b>95</b>
California Recognizes Spoliation as a Tort	98
Development of the Spoliation Tort After <i>Smith v. Superior Court</i>	101
Recognition of the Spoliation Tort After California Rejects It	105
The Negligent Spoliation Cause of Action	107
Spoliation Claims Against Third Parties	108
Elements of the Spoliation Tort	110
Problematic Elements of the Spoliation Tort	111
Willful Destruction Designed to Disrupt Plaintiff's Case	111
Disruption of Plaintiff's Case	112
Damage Proximately Caused By Spoliation	114
Determining the Measure of Damages	118
Unavailability of a Tort Claim to Defendants	121
When Should a Spoliation Tort Claim Be Raised	122

*Chapter 5*

<b>Criminal Sanctions for Spoliation</b>	<b>127</b>
--	------------

*Chapter 6*

<b>Statutory Recordkeeping Obligations</b>	<b>137</b>
--	------------

*Chapter 7*

<b>The Developing Law of Spoliation in State Civil Courts</b>	<b>145</b>
Alabama	145
Alaska	149
Arizona	154
Arkansas	158
California	162
Colorado	169
Connecticut	172
Delaware	175
District of Columbia	177
Florida	182
Georgia	185
Hawaii	189
Idaho	192
Illinois	193

Indiana	198
Iowa	202
Kansas	204
Kentucky	208
Louisiana	210
Maine	216
Maryland	217
Massachusetts	220
Michigan	223
Minnesota	227
Mississippi	229
Missouri	232
Montana	234
Nebraska	236
Nevada	238
New Hampshire	243
New Jersey	246
New Mexico	251
New York	252
North Carolina	257
North Dakota	260
Ohio	264
Oklahoma	268
Oregon	271
Pennsylvania	273
Rhode Island	276
South Carolina	278
South Dakota	280
Tennessee	282
Texas	286
Vermont	295
Virginia	296
Washington	301
West Virginia	304
Wisconsin	309
Wyoming	313

*Chapter 8*

<b>The Developing Law of Spoliation in Federal Courts</b>	<b>317</b>
First Circuit Court of Appeals	318
Second Circuit Court of Appeals	321
Third Circuit Court of Appeals	325
Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals	330
Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals	340
Sixth Circuit Court of Appeals	345

Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals	348
Eighth Circuit Court of Appeals	352
Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals	357
Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals	363
Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals	367
District of Columbia Circuit Court of Appeals	373
Federal Circuit Court of Appeals	377
<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>381</b>
<b>Table of Cases</b>	<b>391</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>441</b>